“EQUITY IS THE TRUTH IN ACTION.”

— JOSEPH JOUBERT
FRENCH MORALIST AND ESSAYIST
“Why do we care?” about equity and some key concepts to get started.

Understanding Equity – Section 5.1
• Equity vs. Equality vs. Justice (5.1.1)
• Important concepts in equity (5.1.2)
• Benefits of investing in equity-focused initiatives (5.1.3)
• First steps towards equity (5.1.4)

Operationalizing Equity – Section 5.2
• Embed equity in your operations (5.2.1)
• Align data & technology programs with your equity goals (5.2.2)
• Best practices to follow (5.2.3)

Check out the resource repository at the end of the section.
5. EQUITY

WHY DO WE CARE?

From the abolition of slavery, to the Fifteenth and Nineteenth Amendments giving people of color and women the right to vote, to the Fair Housing Act, we have seen several momentous milestones in the American history. These legislative milestones marked the end of discrimination on the basis of race and other classes. The reality, however, is that even though we no longer have “explicit” discriminatory laws we still have systems, policies, and attitudes that discriminate against the historically disadvantaged groups in our cities and communities.

The pandemic has disproportionately affected people of color, revealing the gruesome outcome of deeply rooted discrimination and racism in American society. To advance equity, cities and communities should first recognize the existence of inequities. City and community leaders can work together to decide how they move forward or live with the disbelief that inequities don’t exist.

Equity is the key to sustainable and resilient growth in cities and communities as it creates a level-playing field for all. Prioritizing equity can help city and community leaders lay the foundations of a harmonious society where people from all walks of life can co-exist peacefully.

Efforts and resources that fight racism and improve equity should take center stage as cities and communities adopt smart city applications and use data to inform decisions that impact the lives of residents and visitors. Failure to do so will only sustain and perpetuate the vicious cycle of institutional and structural inequities that disproportionately victimize people that have historically faced discrimination in the society.

KEY DEFINITIONS: ¹

- **Affirmative Action** – Policies and practices that favor people from a certain social group who have been discriminated against historically.

- **Racism** – Racism is a doctrine or teaching, without scientific support, that does three things. First, it claims to find racial differences in things like character and intelligence. Second, racism asserts the superiority of one race over another or others. Finally, it seeks to maintain that dominance through a complex system of beliefs, behaviors, use of language and policies.

- **Segregated** – The separation or isolation of a race, class, or ethnic group by enforced or voluntary residence in a restricted area, by barriers to social intercourse, by separate educational facilities, or by other discriminatory means. The separation for special treatment or observation of individuals or items from a larger group.

- **Disadvantaged Group** – Individuals that are at a higher risk of poverty, discrimination, and violence relative to general population. This group may include but is not limited to ethnic minorities, people with disabilities, people of color, and isolated elderly and children.


For better or worse, much of the equity dialogue in America has been focused on racial equity as race has been the most reliable predictor of quality of life. In this section, we capture equity as it relates to race, socio-economic status, gender expression, disability, age, religion, national origin, and minority groups. Equity is the fair and respectful treatment of all individuals so that their quality of life is not determined by who they were born as, who they are or who they identify as. This section provides guidance to cities and communities on how they can understand and embed equity in their operations. We discuss the following:

1. Understanding Equity
2. Operationalizing Equity
3. Equity Resource Repository for Cities and Connected Communities

5.1. UNDERSTANDING EQUITY

5.1.1 HOW SHOULD CITIES AND COMMUNITIES THINK ABOUT EQUITY AND HOW IS IT DIFFERENT FROM EQUALITY AND JUSTICE?

Equity, equality, and justice overlap and intersect with one another. As such, these concepts are often misconceived and even confused in our conversations about how an ideal city or community should look. One of the ways to understand the difference between the three is through the figure below.

FIG.1: UNDERSTANDING THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN EQUITY, EQUALITY, AND JUSTICE

Source: Advancing Equity and Inclusion: A Guide for Municipalities, by City for All Women Initiative (CAWI), Ottawa
Note: This is just one version of the visual. There are a variety of visuals used to talk about the concept of Equity, Inclusion and Diversity.
The image on the left demonstrates the concept of equality as we see the three individuals standing on same sized boxes. Equality often equates to sameness, i.e., providing everyone, irrespective of their needs and identities (see 1.2), the exact same resources. However, equality does not guarantee fairness. The center image illustrates equity where the boxes are distributed based on needs to ensure that all three individuals have a clear view (equal access) of the game. Finally, the third image illustrates justice. The fence eliminated the barrier for the individuals and addressed equal access as the root cause of the inequity (systematic barrier).

The illustration is just one example of many commonly used by researchers, activists, and non-profit organizations to explain the difference between the three concepts.

5.1.2 WHAT ARE SOME OF THE KEY CONCEPTS THAT CITIES AND CONNECTED COMMUNITIES SHOULD KNOW TO BETTER UNDERSTAND EQUITY?4

- **Identity** – A dynamic and complex concept. To say that we are all human beings is true, but it disregards our lived experiences. By acknowledging that we all have different lived experiences, we allow ourselves to be more tolerant and open to understanding and learning from other people’s experiences based on their sex/gender, ethnicity, race, national origin, disability, beliefs, economic status, age, etc. Learn more about the definition of different identities here.

- **Power** – The capacity to exercise control over or decide what’s best for others, who will have access or will be denied access to a resource.

- **Privilege** – The experience of freedoms, rights, benefits, advantages, access and/or opportunities afforded to members of a dominant group in a society.5 A privileged person is someone from a dominant/privileged group that has more power as compared to a marginalized, oppressed or disadvantaged group. Privilege is fluid and can change depending on where one is in their life. Learn more about power and privilege here.

- **Intersectionality** – A concept coined by Kimberlé Crenshaw is based on the recognition that individuals can have multiple identities that intersect with one another. Intersectionality refers to the interplay of one’s identities, the status of those identities, and the situational context of how, when, and where those identities show up and influence personal experience(s) within multiple dimensions of societal oppression.6 Learn more about intersectionality here and also refer to Section 2.1 to learn why municipalities should apply the intersectionality lens.

Enhancing equity requires changing power structures that sustain racism and discrimination. Therefore, understanding the different identities, their intersection, and the existing power structures within different social groups can help city and community leaders achieve greater equity.

---


5.1.3 WHAT ARE THE BENEFITS OF INVESTING IN EQUITY-FOCUSED INITIATIVES?

Smart city applications create opportunities for cities and communities by connecting their neighborhoods and helping them make informed data-based decisions to deliver goods and services efficiently. The flip side of these opportunities is that they can threaten a city or community’s overall health if the benefits from use of technology is inequitably shared among the member of the community. Therefore, city and community leaders should invest in equity-focused initiatives to ensure that the benefits of smart city applications lead to sustainable and equitable outcomes.

Equity is a resiliency challenge. Inequities inhibit long-term growth and prosperity are a chronic stress on the city’s health. Investments in equity-focused initiatives may not bear fruits immediately but they can preserve and protect a city or community’s true culture and identity in the long run. Equity is a driver for sustainable development that can unlock resources to generate higher efficiency in the long run.

5.1.4 HOW CAN CITIES AND COMMUNITIES GET STARTED WITH EQUITY?

• **Look Inward Before Looking Outward:** Start by tasking your Human Resource (HR) department to undertake an assessment of equity and diversity at your workplace. A diverse workplace is essential to ensure representation of the community that you serve or want to attract. Greater representation translates to a range of insights and perspectives that the municipality can leverage on to define its equity goals. Identify group(s) that are un- or under-represented and take immediate steps to build a more diverse and inclusive workforce. To ensure equity in hiring, the city of Portland has an Equal Employment Opportunity Affirmative Action Plan for Minorities & Women. Asheville has a public facing workforce equity dashboard that represents its commitment to ensuring equitable hiring and promotion outcomes within the city.

It is important to understand that diversity and inclusion without equity is not sustainable. Promoting a diverse workforce requires a commitment to ensuring that all individuals are represented and valued.

---


QUESTIONS TO CONSIDER

- What proportion of the workforce are people of color/women/from LGBTQ+ community/have disabilities?
- How diverse is higher level management?
- What affirmative actions can be taken to ensure diversity in hiring and promotions?

DEFINITION

Diversity refers to differences in the values, attitudes, cultural perspective, beliefs, ethnic background, sexual orientation, gender identity, skills, knowledge and life experiences of each individual in any group of people.
workplace is the first step towards equity but not an end in itself.

- **Build Your Equity and Inclusion Team**: Assign resources and budget to build an equity and inclusion team. This team will be responsible for assessing gaps, operationalizing equity, meaningful community engagement, understanding the historical context, and forging strategic partnerships to advance equity goals in the municipality. Several cities have appointed a Chief Equity Officer to oversee their equity and inclusion initiatives. Cities and communities that are resource constrained should consider hiring at least an equity manager to establish their commitment towards equity.

- **Accept and Acknowledge**: One of the major challenges to equity in cities and communities is the disbelief that inequity exists. The first step to solving a problem is acceptance and acknowledgement of the problem. Review and understand the historical context, collect data and document inequities in your city and community. Several cities have created and published equity maps. Some examples include Equity Atlas by the city of San Antonio and Racial Equity Mapping by the city of Asheville. Other organizations that map equity are Community Information Now, National Equity Atlas (also a great resource for equity indicators), and the Demographic Statistical Atlas.

- **Make a Clear Commitment to Enhance Equity**: Cities and connected communities should make a clear and explicit commitment to equity. This can be in the form of a public declaration by: (i) creating an Office of Equity or an Equity Initiative; (ii) releasing a statement to advance equity goals (see the city of St. Louis Park); (iii) defining equity and adopting equity as a guiding principle for the operations of the city or community (see the city of Tacoma); and/or (iv) providing resources and support to historically disadvantaged communities (see the city of Asheville mini-grants for racial healing and the city of Austin’s Mini-Grant Fund for grassroot community organizations). Make sure

TIP
Refer to suggested steps for building your team on pg. 11 of this guide by the National League of Cities.

TIP
Use the Urban Institute’s Spatial Equity Data Tool to map inequities in your city.

QUESTIONS TO CONSIDER
- What indicators should be collected to measure inequities? (See National Equity Atlas or the City of Tacoma’s Equity Index)
- How can we source data on equities?
- What’s the best way to share this data both within and outside the organization?
that this commitment is not just limited to lip service or window dressing (see Section 2 on Operationalizing Equity).

**Benchmark Where You Stand:** Identify your baseline by assessing where you stand. An assessment of practices and the status quo across different departments can help to determine the gaps and identify the areas for improvement. Such an assessment will also help establish equity goals for the municipality. You may refer to the “Environment Scan Checklist” in the Advancing Equity and Inclusion guide (pg. 33 to 36) modify it to suits your organization. Use the activity to identify gaps and obstacles and come up with strategies to overcome them (see Advancing Equity and Inclusion guide). Alternatively, you can also undertake the Racial Equity and Justice Initiative (REJI) Organizational Assessment to assess where you stand.

In the next section, we focus on how cities and communities can operationalize equity and align it with organizational goals and outcomes.

### 5.2. OPERATIONALIZING EQUITY

#### 5.2.1 HOW CAN CITIES AND COMMUNITIES EMBED EQUITY IN THEIR OPERATIONS?

- **Set Equity Goals and Develop an Action Plan:** The most crucial step to operationalizing equity is to document equity goals and outline actions that should be undertaken to achieve those goals. While these goals and strategies will be unique for each municipality there are several good examples to look at such as the city of Asheville’s Equity Action Plan, San Francisco’s Racial and Social Equity Action Plan and 19 actions identified by Portland’s Equity Initiative. Use GARE’s Racial Equity Action Plan – A How-to Manual to draft your own equity goals and action plan.

- **Apply an Intersectionality Lens:** Cities and connected communities can take a step towards understanding equity by identifying the different lived experience of

**TIP**

If you can only do three things you should:

- Research, understand and document the historical context and inequities in your city and community.
- Assess diversity and representation at workplace.
- Commit for the long haul. Start with small steps to advance equity at workplace and in your community.

**TIP**

- Read Section 6 of this guide for steps to create a racial equity plan.
- Encourage your team to conduct the “Intersectionality Wheel Diagram” activity from the Advancing Equity and Inclusion guide.
- Read more on how to put intersectionality into practice.
their residents. The very first step to adopting the lens of intersectionality is by asking your employees to understand their own identities. Adopting the intersectionality lens can help cities move beyond groupthink and consider how different identities interact with the municipality.

- **Educate and Train:** Invest time and resources to educate your employees and encourage them to engage in discussions about equity or partner with other cities, communities, or non-profits to bring in speakers and conduct workshops to raise awareness about equity within the organization. The city of Austin, Texas, conducted “Undoing Racism” in partnership with the People’s Institute for Survival and Beyond to train over 500 community members since 2007. Refer to resource repository for resources on training and education.

Cities and communities can also learn a great deal by engaging with communities. Refer to the Community Engagement section of this guide to learn more.

- **Take an Equity Approach to Budget** – To ensure equity is at the forefront of decision-making across all departments make it a priority and a guiding principle for how the municipality allocates budget. The city of Asheville created an Equity Budget Tool to include equity considerations into their policies and practices for department budgets. The city of Seattle has been using a Racial Equity Toolkit to assess policies, programs and budget issues since 2012. Other cities such as Austin and Philadelphia have also taken steps to integrate equity into their budget-making process.

- **Equitable Procurement and Contracting** – Cities and communities spend millions of dollars on the procurement of various goods and services to serve their municipalities. Equity in procurement and contracting can be a powerful recovery tool that supports and empower businesses owned by people from disadvantaged communities. Read about the innovative tactics that cities are using to enhance equity and learn about five cities that are setting an example of equitable procurement.

### 5.2.2 HOW CAN CITIES AND COMMUNITIES ALIGN DATA AND TECHNOLOGY PROGRAMS WITH EQUITY GOALS?

Data-driven decision-making has helped cities and communities distribute their resources more efficiently. If used responsibly, data can also help to address inequities and make them more visible. Cities and communities should actively take steps to ensure that data sharing and use remains equitable and transparent and does not lead to perpetuation of organizational and structural inequities. Actionable Intelligence for Social Policy (AISP)’s comprehensive toolkit provides guidance on...
how cities and communities can centralize racial equity in their data integration and sharing practices. To assimilate equity more broadly into technology programs, refer to the guide by the Urban Institute for Creating Equitable Technology Programs. The guide provides several examples and case studies of cities that have embedded equity in their technology programs.

5.2.3 WHAT ARE THE BEST PRACTICES FOR CREATING EQUITABLE CITIES AND COMMUNITIES?

- **Train, Educate, Empower, Repeat** – Enhancing equity is a long iterative process and requires continuous learning and training. This includes not only training and educating staff members but also community members and residents. The city of Boston, Massachusetts, runs a series of monthly community race dialogues and has trained facilitators and engaged thousands of residents over the years.

- **Assess and Track Progress** – Take stock of your impact and track your progress. Identify improvements as well as shortcomings. This assessment should guide goal setting for subsequent versions of an action plan. Austin, Texas, has its own Equity Assessment Tool (pg. 10) that it uses to assess the performance of its departments towards advancing their racial equity goals. The Racial Equity Index can help you assess how your city or community is doing as compared to others. The tool can also be used to identify gaps and set equity goals. The next step will be to get the assessment reviewed by an independent third party to establish credibility and trust.

- **Sustain Impact** – Any work around equity will receive pushback from all levels because it challenges the status quo and those in privileged and powerful positions. Therefore, it is important to build momentum and bring about organizational changes to promote equity. Identify champions across all departments who can advocate and enforce guidelines and practices for promoting equity. These champions can play an instrumental role in developing shared practices across departments, mentoring staff as well as countering any resistance to efforts for advancing equity. Get support from all levels, ensure a clear messaging and commitment to equity at all levels of management.

---

**TIP**

Start small! Refer to this guide to develop indicators to measure your performance and assess your progress.

**DEFINITION**

A champion is a person who assumes leadership by working with others to create and influence change in the wider community.

**TIP**

Refer to this toolkit for Community Agreements for Productive Conversations on Race. Use this template to negotiate tangible community benefits for public and private investment.

---

• **Engage the Community and Build Relationships** – The most important seats at the table for equity conversations should be reserved for the members of the community. Work with representative organizations and residents and build accountable relationships to ensure inclusive and equitable growth in your municipality. For example, a [Community Benefits Agreement (CBA)](#) can serve as an effective tool for ensuring equitable outcomes in development projects.

• **Follow Through and Follow Up** – Communicate your progress and demonstrate results with the community to keep everyone on the same page. Publish internal assessments to establish transparency – see Asheville’s internal audit report on [Equity and Inclusion Assessment Report](#) the assessment findings to community members especially to those who actively participated in the meetings. Create channels for community members to submit queries and questions regarding the assessment. Publish frequently asked questions or concerns on your website.

• **Collaborate and Learn from Others** – Partner and collaborate with other cities and communities that may share similar historical contexts or inequities. For cities and communities that are resource-constrained, this may be the most feasible and cost-effective approach to enhancing equity. Additionally, learn from the others who are further along in their journey to integrating equity in their organizational outcomes and goals. For example: (i) Austin’s Equity Action Team has evolved over time into a community body that provides learning and networking opportunities to those interested in equity. The group also includes cities from outside Texas; and (ii) Racial Equity Here was a partnership of five cities – Albuquerque, Austin, Grand Rapids, Louisville, and Philadelphia – to improve equity. Learn about their [experience of operationalizing racial equity](#).

---

### QUESTIONS TO CONSIDER

- With whom can we partner to conduct training?
- What indicators should be used to track progress?
- How can we verify the validity of these indicators?
- How can we communicate the finding and progress so that it reaches all representatives of the community?
- Which local organizations can help advance equity goals?
- How can we forge strategic partnerships with other cities and communities?
### 5.3. EQUITY RESOURCE REPOSITORY FOR CITIES AND COMMUNITIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO.</th>
<th>TITLE/ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>LEVEL</th>
<th>WHAT CAN YOU EXPECT TO LEARN?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Improving Procurement Processes to Promote Economic Equity</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>The document provides several case studies and an implementation plan for advancing economic equity through procurement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Equitable Contracting and Procurement</td>
<td>Beginner</td>
<td>The resource explains equitable contracting and procurement, identifies resources to implement, shares key considerations and provides examples of where it is working.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Advancing Racial Equity and Transforming Government</td>
<td>Beginner – Intermediate</td>
<td>A comprehensive guide that discusses six best practices to advance racial equity. The discussion is augmented with case studies from eight cities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Racial Equity Impact Assessment Guide</td>
<td>Beginner</td>
<td>The two-page document explains what a racial equity impact assessment is, why it is needed and when it should be conducted. The document also provides some questions to consider in order to anticipate, assess and prevent potentially adverse consequences of proposed actions on different racial groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>City for All Women Initiative Publications</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A list of publications around promoting racial and gender equity in municipalities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Racial Equity Tools</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>An incredible resource that provides a comprehensive list of resources and curricula for training, planning, implementing, and evaluating racial equity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Racial Equity Toolkit – An Opportunity to Operationalize Equity</td>
<td>Beginner – Intermediate</td>
<td>The document explains what racial equity tools are, who should use them and how they can be used. It also offers examples and use cases to help you get started with racial equity tools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Equity Assessment Tool</td>
<td>Intermediate – Advanced</td>
<td>The report uses different case studies to explain equity metrics and provides tools to assess potential strategies through the lens of equity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Racial Equity Toolkit</td>
<td>Beginner</td>
<td>This easy-to-read and use toolkit from the city of Seattle can be used to assess policies, initiatives, programs, and budget issues. It offers six steps, worksheet and resources to help with assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO.</td>
<td>TITLE/ORGANIZATION</td>
<td>LEVEL</td>
<td>WHAT CAN YOU EXPECT TO LEARN?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Texas Equity Toolkit</td>
<td>Beginner – Intermediate</td>
<td>It’s a good resource and template to develop your local equitable access plans.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>All-In Cities Policy Toolkit</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A great resource for policy toolkits by topic area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Racial Equity Resource Guide</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A database for resources and guides that can be used by cities and communities for trainings and advancing their racial equity efforts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Portland’s Bureau Racial Equity Plans</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A collection of resources, equity plans, and training material from the city of Portland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Texas Model by Joyce James</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A model developed by Joyce James to improve equity outcomes for all children. The model was implemented by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Diversity Toolkit: A Guide to Discussing Identity, Power and Privilege</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>The toolkit offers several activities for groups of up to 60 people to have a discourse on issues of diversity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ADVANCING EQUITY AT WORKPLACE**

| 16  | The Roadmap for Racial Equity – An Imperative for Workforce Development Advocates | All | Refer to pages 22 and 25 of this report. The following pages discuss including racial equity goals in local and state government workforce development and investing in infrastructure and technical assistance to achieve equity goals. |
| 17  | Advancing Equity | All | Three short articles on: (i) Transforming Culture — An Examination of Workplace Values Through the Frame of White Dominant Culture; (ii) Addressing Bad Behavior in Your Civil Justice System; and (iii) Relearning America’s History of Race — A Beginner’s List of Resources |

**EQUITY AND RESILIENCE REPORTS**

<p>| 18  | Resilient Boston – An Equitable and Connected Cities | All | The report outlines various initiatives and undertaken by the city. It also outlines the city’s strategies and its visions. |
| 19  | Resilient Cities at the Forefront | All | The report discusses the link between urban resilience and racial equity. The report showcases best practices using several examples of equity initiatives in cities such as Boston, Seattle, and Toronto. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO.</th>
<th>TITLE/ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>LEVEL</th>
<th>WHAT CAN YOU EXPECT TO LEARN?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td><strong>Our Equitable Future – A Roadmap for the Chicago Region</strong></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>The documents provide the equity roadmap for the Chicago region. It provides targeted recommendations for advancing equity goals and also features examples of local progress and initiative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td><strong>The Future of Equity in Cities</strong></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A National League of Cities report discusses the importance of equity and looks at infrastructure, economic development, and public safety through the lens of equity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td><strong>Technology and Equity in Cities</strong></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A comprehensive report by the Urban Institute that talks about emerging equity challenges and opportunities for smart infrastructure, shared mobility, civic technology and technology-enhanced data analytics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td><strong>Institutional Racism and Systematic Inequities</strong></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>A report from Austin, Texas that captures the background and context of historical racism and makes recommendations to improve equity in the city.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>